

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
PREFACE	viii
INTRODUCING THE PERM-TO-GREEN-CARD PATH AND THE PLAYERS, HURDLES, AND TRAPS YOU ARE LIKELY TO ENCOUNTER ALONG THE WAY	1
Introduction.....	1
Federal Agencies You Will Encounter and the Three Main Steps You Must Complete to Obtain Green Cards through PERM	1
Main Things the Federal Agencies Look for at Each Major Step.....	2
PERM at DOL.....	2
I-140 Petition at USCIS	2
I-485 Application (or Consular Processing at DOS).....	3
Employers, Employees, and Their Perspectives	3
“Employer”	3
Perspectives within the “Employer”	4
Human Resources Personnel.....	4
Technical Manager.....	4
General Counsel.....	5
Perspectives of the Employee	5
Why Timing is So Critical throughout the PERM-to-Green-Card Effort.....	5
If You Misunderstand, Miscalculate, or Miss a Deadline, Your Case May Fail	5
Estimate Timing <i>Conservatively</i> to Improve Client Relations	6
Your Client’s Friend’s Case Always Goes Faster and Smoother	6
Find and Resolve All Major Problems <i>Early</i> in the Process.....	6
Together, DOL and USCIS/DOS Have “One Fist of Iron, the Other of Steel. If the Right One Don’t Get You, the Left One Will.”	7
Conclusion	7
KNOWING WHAT TO DO AND WHEN TO DO IT: A STEP-BY-STEP GUIDE TO SUCCESSFUL PERM LABOR CERTIFICATION PRACTICE	9
Introduction.....	12
Step 1: Exchanging Information with the Client(s)	12
Scope and Terms of Engagement.....	12
Initial Contact.....	13
Getting Terms in Writing	13
Addressing and Clarifying Dual Representation	13
Strategy Discussion with Employer and Employee.....	13
Employer Questionnaire	14
General Company Information	14
Companies with Small Number of Employees; Employee Ownership; Familial Relationships	14
Employer’s “Ability to Pay” Documentation	14
Layoffs	15
Full-Time and Permanent Job Offer	15
Foreign-National Employee Questionnaires.....	15
Basic Biographical Information for Employee and Any Dependents.....	15

Subsequent Employment Verification Questionnaire for Employee.....15

Step 2: Analyzing Minimum Job Requirements and Employee Qualifications.....15

 “Real World” Job Requirements versus PERM Job Requirements16

 Analyzing the Job Requirements16

 Guidelines for Employers16

 “Normal” Requirements.....17

 Qualifying Experience with the PERM Employer.....17

 Disparate Occupations17

 Alternative Requirements17

 Carefully Analyzing the PERM Beneficiary’s Qualifications.....18

 Ensuring Thoroughness in Reviewing the Exact Experience of the PERM Beneficiary.....18

 PERM Beneficiary’s Experience Gained While with the PERM Employer.....19

 Education Gained While with the PERM Employer20

 Education, I-140 Petition, and Immigrant Visa Categories20

 Getting It in Writing—The “Experience” Questionnaire and the “Experience” Letters21

Step 3: Prevailing Wage and Related Issues21

 Submitting the Prevailing Wage Request.....21

 2018 SOC Revisions22

 Worksites, Telecommuting, and Traveling Post-COVID.....22

 CBA, SCA, DBA, and Alternate Surveys.....22

 Reviewing the Prevailing Wage Determination.....23

 Options If Prevailing Wage Determination Is Unacceptable23

 Tips for Prevailing Wages24

 Before Recruitment: “Business Necessity” for Requirements That Are Not “Normal”25

Step 4: Recruitment.....25

 Mandatory Recruitment for All Occupations (Nonprofessional and Professional).....25

 SWA Job Order26

 Two Sunday Ads26

 Notice of Filing.....26

 Additional Recruitment for “Professional” Occupations27

 Drafting PERM-Compliant Advertisements27

 Clarity: How Much Information Is Enough to Apprise U.S. Workers of the Job Opportunity?.....28

 Wage: If the Employer Includes the Wage, What If the PERM Beneficiary Earns More Than the Prevailing Wage; Is It Still Okay to List Only the Prevailing Wage in the Advertisements?.....28

 Understatement: Aside from Wages, What Other Terms of Employment Might Be Considered “Less Favorable” Than Those Offered to the PERM Beneficiary?29

 Timing of Recruitment Advertisements29

 Strategic Choice: Who Should Place Advertisements?.....30

 Attorney Oversees Advertisement Placement.....30

 Employer Oversees Advertisement Placement30

 Third Party Oversees Advertisement Placement.....31

 Prompt and Thorough Followup with Applicants.....31

 Recruitment Tips.....32

Step 5: Post-Recruitment 30-Day “Quiet” Period32

 Completing the Audit File *and* Related Tasks.....33

 Reviewing Employer’s *Preliminary* Recruitment Results.....33

Drafting and Ensuring Accuracy of the Form ETA-908934

Notes or Memo to Record Unusual Aspects of Case34

30-Day “Quiet” Period Tips.....34

Step 6: Filing Form ETA-908935

 Prefiling Cleanup and Review35

 Employer Review and Approval of Final Recruitment Report.....35

 Employer Confirmation of No Layoffs.....36

 Final Review36

 Submission of Form ETA-9089 through FLAG36

Step 7: Postfiling Tasks36

Step 8: Stay Abreast of Frequent DOL Changes.....36

 Resources You Will Use Frequently37

 The PERM Regulations, 20 CFR Parts 655 and 65637

 Board of Alien Labor Certification Appeals Decisions.....37

 PERM Processing Times.....37

 Occupation and Wage Research.....37

Conclusion38

**SPOTTING FACTS THAT TELL YOU THAT PERM WILL BE DIFFICULT OR IMPOSSIBLE—
AND SEEKING WAYS TO ADDRESS SUCH DIFFICULTIES39**

 Introduction.....39

 Facts and Circumstances Indicating That Your Client’s Case May Be a Dead End.....39

 The Proffered Salary Is Far Too Low and Cannot Be Raised39

 The Employer’s Financial Documents Indicate That They are Currently Very Weak Financially...40

 Education/Experience Requirements Are Excessively Low in an Area of High Unemployment ...40

 Employer Insistence on Abnormally High Education and Experience Requirements41

 Employer Had Recent Layoffs.....41

 The Beneficiary Qualifies for the Position Only Through
 Substantially Different Alternate Requirements42

 The Beneficiary Does Not Have the Required Degree42

 The Beneficiary’s Degree Fails to Meet USCIS Equivalency Standards42

 The Beneficiary Cannot Verify Prior Experience43

 The Beneficiary Lacks Required License43

 The Beneficiary Has Ownership or Familial Relationships with Sponsoring Employer.....43

 Anticipating and Addressing Client Reaction to Learning That Their Case Cannot Go Forward44

 Considering Alternatives to PERM.....45

 Hypothetical Fact Pattern for Analyzing the Most Common Potential Alternatives to PERM45

 Aliens with Extraordinary Ability (EB-1A)46

 Outstanding Professors or Researchers (EB-1B).....47

 National Interest Waiver (NIW).....47

 Schedule A, Group II (Exceptional Ability)48

 Multinational Executives and Managers (EB-1C)48

 EB-5 Immigrant Investor Visa49

 Other Options to Explore and Consider at the Outset of the Case, If Applicable.....49

 Schedule A, Group I for Professional Nurses and Physical Therapists49

 Family- and Marriage-Based Immigration50

 Diversity Visa Lottery.....50

 Religious Workers50

 Asylum50

Conclusion50

CREATING A CRYSTAL BALL: EMPLOYER-RELATED ISSUES TO SPOT BEFORE COMMENCING A PERM CASE 51

Section I: Collecting Information About the Employer and Employee—Identifying Approvability and Discovering Potential Pitfalls.....53

 Issues Associated with the Timing of the Filing of a PERM Application54

 Using the PERM Application as a Retention Tool.....54

 Beginning the PERM Process Early May Save the Employer Significant Costs in College and University Settings54

 A Timely Filed PERM Application Will Secure the Foreign Worker’s Ability to Maintain Work Authorization until Permanent Resident Status Is Granted.....55

 Issues Associated with the Employer’s Corporate Information.....56

 Issue: The Employer’s Legal Name56

 Issue: Close Familial Relationships and Foreign Worker Ownership56

 Issue: Employer’s Number of Employees:.....56

 Issues Associated with the Employer’s Worksite Location:

 Multiple Worksites, Roving Employees, and Virtual/Home Offices57

 Issues Associated with the Wage Offered and Proving the Employer’s Ability to Pay.....58

 Issues Associated with the Offered Position59

 Issue: Job Title59

 Issue: Education and Experience Requirements60

 Issue: Newly Created Positions61

 Issue: When Can Qualifying Experience Be Gained with the Same Employer?.....61

 Issue: Too Much of a Good Thing? Audit Triggers and Abnormal Job Requirements62

 Issue: Layoffs.....62

Section II: Apprising Employers of Their Key Role, Obligations, and Commitment

When Starting the PERM Process63

 What Should the Practitioner Tell the Employer?63

 1. The Employer’s Financial Obligations64

 2. The Employer’s Role in Drafting the Job Description/Advertisement Text.....65

 3. The Employer’s Role in the Recruitment Process67

 4. The Employer’s Role with DOL.....71

 5. The Employer’s Obligation to Maintain the Compliance File.....71

Section III: Apprising Employers of the Consequences of Sponsoring a Foreign Worker without Proper Work Authorization71

Conclusion72

EMPLOYEE-RELATED ISSUES TO SPOT BEFORE COMMENCING A PERM CASE73

Section I: Identifying Potential Bases of Inadmissibility, Including Whether the Foreign Worker Is Subject to the “Bars”.....73

 Issue: Fraud-Related Grounds of Inadmissibility73

 Issue: Criminal Grounds of Inadmissibility75

 Issue: Health-Related Grounds of Inadmissibility76

 Issue: Public Charge Ground of Inadmissibility77

 Issue: Foreign Worker Entered Without Inspection or Has Accrued Unlawful Presence Rendering Them Subject to the Three-Year, Ten-Year, or Permanent Bar77

Section II: Identifying Possible Issues Relating to the Nonimmigrant Status of the Foreign Worker...79

 Issue: Foreign Worker Is in H-1B Status and Subject to a Maximum Period of Stay79

Issue: Foreign Worker is an L-1 Intracompany Transferee Subject to a Maximum Period of Stay in the United States..... 80

Issue: Foreign Worker Is or Was an Exchange Visitor in J-1 Status, Subject to the Two-Year Home-Residency Requirement..... 81

Issue: Foreign Worker Is in Nonimmigrant Worker Status Pursuant to Free Trade Agreements—TN, E-3, H-1B1..... 82

Issue: Foreign Worker Is a Student in Nonimmigrant F-1 Status..... 83

Issue: Foreign Worker Is in Other Nonimmigrant Status..... 83

Section III: Identifying When Foreign Worker Will Be Able to Pursue Permanent Residence and Capturing, When Possible, an Earlier Priority Date..... 84

 Issue: The Foreign Worker’s Priority Date Based on the PERM Case to Be Filed..... 84

 Issue: Foreign Worker Was the Beneficiary of a Previously Filed Labor Certification or Petition, or May Be “Portable”..... 85

 Issue: Foreign Worker Can Be “Grandfathered” under INA §245(i)..... 86

Section IV: Identifying Familial Issues..... 86

 Issue: The Foreign Worker Is Single..... 86

 Issue: The Foreign Worker’s and Spouse’s Country of Birth and “Cross-Chargeability”..... 87

 The Nonimmigrant Status of the Foreign Worker’s Spouse..... 87

 Issue: The Foreign Worker’s Child Will Reach the Age of 21 before the Foreign Worker and Derivative Family Members Are Able to File I-485 Applications to Adjust Status..... 88

Conclusion..... 88

CHART TO VERIFY FOREIGN NATIONAL’S AND DERIVATIVES’ ADMISSIBILITY BEFORE TAKING A CASE..... 89

SCHEDULE A, GROUP II: IMMIGRANT VISA STANDARDS AND PRACTICE TIPS..... 105

 Introduction..... 105

 DOL Regulations..... 105

 The Legal Standard for Arts and Sciences..... 106

 Prong 1: Widespread Acclaim and International Recognition Accorded by Recognized Experts..... 106

 Prong 2: Confirmation that the Foreign National’s Work During the Past Year Did, and Intended Work Will, Require Exceptional Ability..... 107

 Prong 3: Confirmation that the Foreign National Meets at Least Two Regulatory Criteria..... 108

 The Legal Standard for Performing Arts..... 110

 Additional DOL Requirements..... 110

 “International” Legal Standard..... 110

 Form ETA-9089..... 111

 Posting Notice Requirement..... 111

 Prevailing Wage Determination..... 111

 Meeting the USCIS Requirements..... 112

 Second-Preference Employment-Based Immigrant Visa..... 112

 Third-Preference Employment-Based Immigrant Visa..... 113

 Conclusion..... 113

 Appendix A: Schedule A, Group II Chart..... 115

SPECIAL HANDLING: THE COMPETITIVE EDGE..... 117

 Sources..... 117

 Statute..... 117

 Regulations..... 118

Technical Assistance Guide	118
FAQs	118
Technology and Modernization Efforts: FLAG.....	118
Special Handling Advantages and Challenges.....	119
Institutions Can Use Their Real-World Recruitment and Streamline Labor Certification Sponsorship.....	120
Special Handling Is Relatively Streamlined, Even with Reselection	120
Special Handling Challenges	121
Establishing Model Practices Can Streamline Special Handling Cases	121
Qualifying Institutions and Positions.....	122
Positions That Qualify for Special Handling.....	122
What Constitutes <i>Classroom</i> Teaching	124
Combination of Occupations	124
Special Handling Requirements and the Step-by-Step Process.....	125
Step 1: Obtain Foreign Worker’s Date of Selection to Determine the Filing Deadline.....	125
Date of Selection for a Reselection Case.....	126
Step 2: Verify that the Institution Recruited in the Required Sources	127
Print Journals	128
Electronic or Web-Based National Professional Journals.....	128
What Constitutes an Acceptable Electronic or Web-Based National Professional Journal? ..	129
Is a One-Day Print Advertisement in a National Professional Journal, or One 30-Day Online Ad in an Electronic or Web-Based National Professional Journal Enough?.....	131
ETA-9089: Appendix D	132
Step 3. Ad Content, Beneficiary Qualifications, and Rejecting U.S. Workers.....	132
Challenges in Institutional Advertising Practices	133
Impact of <i>Matter of East Tennessee State</i>	133
All but Dissertation (ABD).....	134
Ad and Form Consistency.....	135
Experience: Applicable and (Non)Ambiguous Requirements.....	136
The Institution Must Show That the Selected Foreign Worker Is More Qualified Than Each U.S. Worker Who Applied for the Job	136
The Foreign Worker Must Satisfy Advertised Requirements	137
Step 4. Obtain the Selection Committee’s Report	138
Step 5. Obtain the Hiring Official’s Statement to Verify That the Institution Engaged in a “Competitive Recruitment and Selection Process”.....	139
Hiring Authority’s Statement Attesting to Foreign Worker’s Education and Qualifications	141
Step 6: Drafting Labor Certification (Form ETA-9089) for Special Handling Processing	141
PERM Job Opportunity and Wage Information.....	141
Job Duties and Requirements.....	141
Education Requirements	142
Training, Special Skills or Other Requirements	142
Other Special Skills or Requirements	142
Experience in an Alternate Occupation.....	143
Job Duties.....	143
Foreign Language Requirement.....	143
Recruitment Information (ETA-9089 Preliminary Questions and Appendix D).....	143
Foreign Worker Information (ETA-9089 Appendix A.A –A.E)	144
Step 7. Obtain the Required Prevailing Wage Determination.....	145

Determining the Appropriate Source 145

PWD Should Be Valid/Unexpired on Date Special Handling Case Filed
under 20 CFR §656.18..... 147

Step 8. Provide the Appropriate Notice of Filing 148

Step 9: Assemble the Compliance File 150

Step 10: Submit the Special Handling Application..... 151

Step 11: Provide the Institution with the Compliance File for Its Maintenance..... 151

When Special Handling Based on the Original Search Cannot or Should Not Be Pursued..... 151

 The “Reselection Procedure,” or the Basic Labor Certification Process 151

When Another Process May Be More Advantageous..... 152

 When the Processing Times Suggest That Another Process Is Advisable: The Visa Number
 Unavailability Problem 152

 The EB-1 Outstanding Professor Petition and the EB-1 Extraordinary Ability Petition 153

 The Schedule A, Group II Process 154

Conclusion 154

**PERM ACTUAL MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS: WHEN A BENEFICIARY HAS GAINED REQUIRED
EXPERIENCE, TRAINING, OR EDUCATION AFTER JOINING THE EMPLOYER FILING THE
APPLICATION..... 155**

 Introduction..... 155

 Mastering the Circuitry of Forms ETA-9141 and ETA-9089 156

 No Errors..... 156

 No Modification of Form ETA-9089 after Filing 157

 Weaponizing Form ETA-9089 157

 The Regulatory Framework: Actual Minimum Requirements 159

 Complications Involving the Beneficiary’s Experience and/or Training..... 163

 When Some or All of the Beneficiary’s Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained While
 Working for the Employer Filing the Labor Certification Application..... 163

 Substantial Incomparability 163

 Drafting Form ETA-9089 to Show Substantial Incomparability 164

 Infeasibility to Train..... 168

 When There Has Been a Break in the Beneficiary’s Employment 170

 When Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained with a Predecessor or Related Entity 170

 When Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained after Joining the Employer,
 but with a Different Entity 172

 When Qualifying Experience Has Been Gained as a Contractor Working
 for the Entity Filing the Labor Certification Application..... 172

 When the Beneficiary Has No Experience in the Position to be Certified..... 173

 Complications Involving the Beneficiary’s Education 174

 Conclusion 178

HIRING THE BEST QUALIFIED WORKER: PERM’S “INFEASIBILITY-TO-TRAIN” EXCEPTION .. 179

 Introduction..... 179

 Summary of Legislative Background 180

 Infeasibility-to-Train Standards 181

 Personnel Changes (Layoffs, Worker Attrition, Reductions in Force, Downsizing)..... 182

 Changing Technological, Business, and Economic Circumstances..... 184

 When Training Is Impossible and the Requirements Cannot Be Reduced 185

 Documenting Infeasibility to Train..... 186

 Conclusion 187

IDENTIFYING THE EMPLOYER’S REQUIREMENTS FOR THE POSITION BEFORE DRAFTING AN APPROVABLE AND APPROPRIATE PERM APPLICATION 189

- Prepare the Job Description 189
- Determine the Appropriate O*NET Classification 190
- Determine the Specific Vocational Preparation (SVP) Classification..... 190
- Does the Position Require a Foreign Language?..... 192
- Does the Position Require Duties That Reflect a Combination of Occupations? 193
- Can the Beneficiary Prove Qualifications for the Position?..... 194
- Three-Year Degrees and Other Equivalency Issues..... 196
- Degree in a Different Field 197
- Appendix 1: Evidence of Qualifications 198

DOCUMENTING BUSINESS NECESSITY: THE EMPLOYER’S STATEMENT, SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION, AND THE NEW ETA-9089 QUESTION G.9 199

- The *Information Industries* Standard 199
- The Business Necessity Summary: Completing Appendix C..... 200
- Audit Response Documentation: The Employer’s Statement..... 200
 - Preliminary Matters: Audience, Author, Format..... 201
 - Developing the Employer’s Statement 202
 - Prong One, Step One: The Employer’s Business 202
 - Prong One, Step Two: The Role of the Position in the Employer’s Business 202
 - Prong Two: Relating the Requirements to the Duties 203
- Audit Response Documentation: Other Supporting Documentation..... 203
- Conclusion 204
- Appendix A: Sample 1,500-Character Business Necessity Statement for Appendix C of Form ETA-9089..... 206
- Appendix B: Sample Employer’s Statement of Business Necessity in Response to an Audit Request 207

PREVAILING WAGES UNDER PERM: HOW TO “DO THE RIGHT THING” 211

- Introduction..... 211
- Identifying the Right Wage Source 212
 - Collective Bargaining Agreements, University Wage Scales, and Salaries for Athletes 212
 - The Davis-Bacon Act and Service Contract Act 212
 - 100 Percent of Prevailing Wage 213
 - Private Surveys 213
 - Survey Criteria 214
 - Use of the Median 215
 - Continuation of Past Policies 215
 - BLS Is No Longer Available..... 216
 - Permissible Components of Compensation 216
- Finding the Right Job Description or Classification 216
 - Shopping for an SOC Code 218
- Locating the Right Level 219
 - The Levels Worksheet 222
 - Step 1: Find the Correct O*NET Code and Enter the Job’s Requirements 222
 - Step 2: Complete the Experience Section 223
 - Step 3: Complete the Education Section 224
 - Step 4: Complete the Special Skills and Other Requirements Section 225

Step 5: Complete Supervisory Duties Section	227
Final Step: Total the Points	227
Finding the Right Wage Level When the Employer Specifies Alternative Job Requirements	227
Finding the Right Location for the Roving Employee.....	228
Using the Right Form and Procedures.....	229
PWD Form Validity Date	231
Arguing for the Right Wage Determination—Creating an Appeal Record	232
BALCA Review	234
Using the Right PWD in an Audit Response	234
How to Prevent PWD Processing Delays from Ruining Your Case.....	234
Conclusion	235
Appendix A.....	236
Appendix B.....	237
WHAT ARE SOC CODES AND WHY DO THEY MATTER IN PERM?	239
UNDERSTANDING SVP IN PERM	243
The Difference between SVP Lapsed Time and SVP Level.....	244
The Number of SVP Years Credited by Education.....	244
Associate’s Degree and SVP.....	244
Bachelor’s Degree and SVP.....	245
Master’s and Doctoral Degrees and SVP.....	245
BALCA Case Law Regarding SVP	245
Cases Addressing SVP in Evaluating the Equivalency of Alternate Requirements	245
Cases in Which SVP Analysis by BALCA and/or the CO Is All Wrong.....	246
Conclusion	248
DOCUMENTING TRAVEL REQUIREMENTS IN THE AGE OF TELECOMMUTING AND WORKFORCE MOBILITY	251
Defining Travel Requirements.....	251
Telecommuting, Remote Work, Telehealth.....	253
Telehealth.....	254
Roving, Multiple Worksites, Relocation	255
Traveling and Commuting	255
BALCA Decisions	256
Conclusion	257
ANATOMY OF FORM ETA-9089: AN ITEM-BY-ITEM DISCUSSION	259
Getting to the Current Form ETA-9089	259
Introduction/History.....	259
Preparing the Form ETA-9089—Item by Item.....	260
Instructions for the Form	260
When to Use This Form.....	261
Preliminary Questions on the Form ETA-9089	261
Supervised Recruitment (paper form Item H.a).....	261
Occupation Type (paper form Item H.b).....	261
Section A: Employer Information.....	262
Items A.1 and A.2: Legal Business Name/ Trade Name/DBA	263
Items A.3 through A.9: Employer Address	263
Items A.10 and A.11: Employer Telephone Number	263
Item A.12: Federal Employer Identification Number (FEIN) from IRS.....	263
Item A.13: NAICS Code.....	264

Item A.14: Number of Employees in the Area of Intended Employment.....	264
Item A.15: Year Commenced Business.....	264
Item A.16: Is the employer a closely held corporation, partnership, or sole proprietorship in which the foreign worker has an ownership interest?.....	264
Item A.17: Is there a familial relationship between the foreign worker and the owners, stockholders, partners, corporate officers, and/or incorporators?.....	265
Section B: Employer Point of Contact.....	265
Items B.1 through B.11: Contact's Name, Job Title, and Address.....	265
Items B.12 through B.14: Contact Information, Telephone Number, and Email Address.....	266
Section C: Attorney or Agent Information.....	266
Section D: Foreign Worker Information.....	266
Item D.1: Completed Appendix A Attached?.....	266
Item D.2: Has the employer contracted with an agent or attorney that also represents the foreign worker covered by this application?.....	266
Section E: Job Opportunity and Wage Information.....	267
Item E.1: Prevailing Wage Determination Case Number.....	267
Item E.2: If a valid PWD has <u>not</u> been obtained due to the employer being required to undergo supervised recruitment indicate whether a completed Form ETA-9141 is attached to this application.....	267
Items E.3 and E.4: Offered Wage.....	267
Item E.5: Additional conditions about the offered wage (limited to 500 characters).....	268
Section F: Area of Intended Employment (Worksite Information).....	268
Items F.a through F.c: Worksite Information (where work is to be performed).....	268
Section G: Additional Job Opportunity Information and Other Requirements.....	270
Item G.1: Is this a permanent position offering full-time employment of generally 35 hours or more?.....	270
Item G.2: Is the employer seeking labor certification for live-in household domestic service worker?.....	270
Item G.3: Employer willing to accept foreign diploma/degree?.....	271
Item G.4: Foreign Worker Currently Working for Employer?.....	271
Item G.5: Is the Employer Relying Solely on Experience the Foreign Worker Gained with the Employer?.....	272
Item G.6: Does the Job Require the Worker to Live on the Employer's Premises?.....	274
Item G.7: Does the job involve a combination of occupations?.....	274
Item G.8: Foreign language required or preferred?.....	274
Item G.9: Do the job requirements exceed the Specific Vocational Preparation (SVP) level?.....	275
Item G.10: Did the employer use a credentialing service to qualify the foreign national for the job opportunity?.....	277
Item G.11: Has the Employer Received Payment of Any Kind for the Submission of This Application?.....	278
Item G.12: Has the Employer Had a Layoff in the Area in the Occupation or Related Occupation within Six Months Preceding the Filing of This Application in the Area of Intended Employment?.....	279
Section H: Recruitment Information.....	279
Items H.c.1a. and H.c.1b: Start/End Dates for SWA Job Order.....	280
Items H.c.2 through H.c.3: Is There a Sunday Edition of the Newspaper (of General Circulation) in the Area of Intended Employment?.....	281

Item H.d: Additional Recruitment Requirements for Professional Occupations under 20 CFR §656.17(e)(ii).....282

Item H.e: Notice of Posting (Filing).....286

Section I: Employer Labor Condition Statements/Attestations288

Section J: Preparer289

Appendix A: Foreign Worker Information289

 Appendix A.A: Foreign Worker Contact Information289

 Appendix A.B: Foreign Worker Education.....290

 Appendix A.C: Foreign Worker’s Training, Certification(s), and/or License(s) Information ..291

 Appendix A.D: Foreign Worker’s Skills, Abilities, Proficiencies.....291

 Appendix A.E: Foreign Worker’s Work Experience.....291

Appendix B: Additional Worksite Information292

Appendix C: Supplemental Information292

Appendix D: Special Recruitment for College and University Teachers under 20 CFR §656.18..292

 Appendix D.1: Date Foreign Worker Selected for the Position.....292

 Appendix D.2 through D.4: Name of National Professional Journal, Educational Organizational Publication, or Other Publication in Which Advertisement Placed, with Start Date of Advertisement.....293

 Appendix D.5: Specify Additional Recruitment.....293

Submission of Form ETA-9089 in FLAG.....293

Audit of Form ETA-9089.....294

Form ETA-9089 Final Determination: Permanent Employment Labor Certification Approval294

 Item A: For Government Use Only.....294

 Item B: Foreign Worker Declaration.....294

 Item C: Attorney or Agent Declaration.....294

 Item D: Employer Declaration.....295

Postadjudication and Other Issues295

 Withdrawal of Form ETA-9089 in the FLAG System.....295

 Withdrawal of Legacy ETA Form 9089 and Refiling295

 Multiple Filings.....296

 Validity Period296

 Amendments297

 Employer Reorganization297

 Request for Duplicate Certified Form ETA-9089298

Attachment A: Prevailing Wage Guidance Chart of Impact of Job Requirements on Wage Levels299

Attachment B: Comparison of SVP and O*NET Guidelines for Education and Experience Requirements.....300

Attachment C: Important DOL Email Addresses301

DRAFTING PERM APPLICATIONS TO ENSURE I-140 APPROVAL303

 Introduction.....303

 The Foreign National Needs to Meet the Requirements as Stated on the Form ETA-9089303

 The Foreign National Must Prove They Meet Every Requirement.....304

 Education Requirements304

 Education Documentation.....305

 Credentials Evaluation305

 Training Documentation305

 Experience Documentation305

 Employer Unavailability.....306

Documentation of Special or Specific Requirements306

Acceptability of Foreign Degrees307

Degree Equivalencies in the PERM and I-140 Context307

EB-3 Classification308

EB-2 Classification309

Master’s Degree309

Bachelor’s Degree + Five309

Progressive Experience310

Three-for-One Equivalencies310

Defining a Related Degree311

The Foreign National Must Meet the Requirements of Forms ETA-9141 and ETA-9089
at the Time of Filing311

Anticipating a Promotion or Other Changes in the Job311

Employer Information312

 Employer’s Name and FEIN312

 Employer’s Address313

 Signature313

Changing Worksite Locations313

 The Employer Moves313

 The Employee’s Worksite Location Changes314

 Roving Employees314

Prevailing Wage/Ability to Pay314

Conclusion315

**WHEN AND HOW SHOULD EMPLOYERS USE THE *KELLOGG* LANGUAGE
IN PERM APPLICATIONS?**317

 Introduction317

Matter of Francis Kellogg, Pre-PERM318

 Current *Kellogg* Standards318

 May the CO Deny an Application for Failure to State the *Kellogg* Language
 on Form ETA-9089?320

 When Is an Employer Not Subject to the *Kellogg* Language?321

 Which Requirements Are Not Considered “Substantially Equivalent”?323

 Conclusion324

THE RECRUITMENT PROCESS UNDER PERM327

 Introduction327

 Recruitment Procedures327

 Recruitment Timeframe Calculations329

 Newspaper Advertisements329

 Selection of Newspapers of General Circulation330

 The Employer’s Name330

 Where to Apply330

 The Job Description; Multiple Job Opportunities331

 Identifying the Geographic Area331

 Obtaining a Prevailing Wage and the Option of Including It in the Advertisement333

 Journal Advertisements333

 Placing a Job Order334

 Additional Recruitment Steps for Professional Positions335

 Notice of Filing Requirements336

Avoid Duplicating Recruitment Methods337

Trust but Verify!337

Conducting and Documenting Recruitment.....338

 The Recruitment Report.....338

 When an Employer Does Not Need to Reach Out to a Job Applicant;
 When Further Inquiry Is Required.....339

 What Constitutes a “Reasonable Period of On-the-Job Training”339

 Telephone Interviews and Written Questionnaires341

 The Timeliness and Manner of Contact341

 The Attorney’s Role in the Labor Certification Process342

Conclusion343

THE 10 ADDITIONAL RECRUITMENT STEPS FOR PROFESSIONAL POSITIONS345

 Introduction.....345

 Advertisement Content346

 Job Fairs.....347

 Employer’s Website347

 Job Search Website Other Than the Employer’s.....347

 On-Campus Recruiting348

 Trade or Professional Organizations.....348

 Private Employment Firms348

 Employee Referral Program with Incentives.....349

 Campus Placement Offices349

 Local and Ethnic Newspapers.....350

 Radio and Television Advertisements.....350

 Conclusion350

TO BATCH OR NOT TO BATCH (THE PERM RECRUITMENT).....351

 So Many PERMs, So Little Time351

 “What Is Batching?”351

 Types of Job/Company Profiles That Best Benefit from Batch351

 How Do You Batch?352

 Benefits and Pitfalls of Batching.....353

 Benefits353

 Pitfalls354

 Pro Tips354

 Conclusion355

**THE NEW NORMAL IN PERM RECRUITMENT: COMPLIANCE WITH STATE AND LOCAL EQUAL
PAY TRANSPARENCY LAWS IN JOB POSTINGS.....357**

 Introduction and Scope357

 Refresher Overview of PERM Prevailing Wage, Advertising, and Notice Requirements358

 The Impact of State and Local Wage Transparency Laws on PERM Advertising
 and Notice of Filing Content.....359

 Rumor Control: The Concept of Federal Preemption.....359

 The New Job Posting Tug-of-War: Complying with Two Sets of Laws.....360

 Practice Methodology361

 All-in-One: EPT Laws with a Built-In Long-Arm Reach.....361

 Keeping it Simple: Suggested Best Practices for Compliance in PERM Recruitment
 and Notices of Filing.....362

 What PERM Steps?.....362

What Wage Data?.....363

What Ifs?.....363

Final Practice Pointers.....363

Conclusion.....364

Appendix: Job Postings: Equal Pay Transparency Chart by Jurisdiction.....365

LAYOFF PROVISIONS UNDER PERM.....373

DOL’s Pre-PERM Treatment of Layoffs.....373

Layoffs under PERM.....374

Practice Pointers.....378

Conclusion.....378

WHEN IS A JOB CLEARLY OPEN? TOWARDS A UNIFIED THEORY OF 20 CFR §650.10(c)(8).....379

History.....379

Scope.....379

Purpose, Standard, and Application.....380

Recent Developments.....381

Successful Defense.....382

Conclusion.....383

LAWFUL, JOB-RELATED REASONS AN EMPLOYER CAN USE TO REJECT AN APPLICANT.....385

Introduction.....385

Lack of Major Requirement and No Alternative Field of Study or Alternative Combination of Education and Experience Accepted.....385

When a Duty Arises to Conduct Further Inquiry.....386

Perform Job Opportunities during a Reasonable Period of On-the-Job Training.....386

Lack of Experience is a Lawful Reason for Rejecting Applicants.....387

Unwillingness to Accept Offered Wage.....387

Specific Job Requirements Must Be Explicit.....387

Applicant is Not a U.S. Citizen or Legal Permanent Resident.....387

Conclusion.....388

PERM AUDITS: TRUMP’S INCREASING SCRUTINY AND BIDEN’S ENFORCEMENT PRIORITIES—OPONENTS ALIGN.....389

Introduction.....389

What Is a PERM Audit?.....390

Types of PERM Audits.....392

Preparing for a Random Audit: Compiling the Audit Package before Filing the Application.....392

General Documentation Requests Contained in Most or All Audits.....393

Whether to Include SWA Job Order Documentation in the Audit Response.....395

Preparing the Recruitment Report.....395

Preparing Business Necessity Documentation.....396

Strategies for Remedying Errors in the Context of a PERM Audit.....399

Errors on the Form ETA-9089.....399

Strategies for Remedying Missing Documentation in the Context of a PERM Audit.....399

Audits Requesting Copies of Applicant Résumés.....400

Demonstrating U.S. Worker Applicants Could Not Obtain Missing Skills through On-the-Job Training.....400

Audits Requesting Evidence That There Have Been No Improper Payments by the Employer or Foreign National.....401

Audit Triggers: Anticipating and Preparing for Specific Requests Contained in Targeted Audit Notices.....401

Proof of Business Necessity.....402

 Requirements Exceeding the SVP Level for the Occupation402

 Foreign Language Requirement.....403

Documentation That the Employer’s Alternative Requirements Are “Substantially Equivalent” to the Primary Requirements for the Job Opportunity.....403

Degree Equivalencies.....404

Documentation That Experience Gained with the Sponsoring Employer Is “Not Substantially Comparable” to the Position Specified on the Application, or That It Is No Longer Feasible for the Employer to Train a Worker for the Position405

Documentation of Compliance with Layoff Requirements405

Employee Referral Programs.....406

Live-In Domestic Workers.....407

Improvements for the PERM Audit Program407

CONQUERING THE MAZE OF SUPERVISED RECRUITMENT: AN OVERVIEW409

 Introduction.....409

 What Is SR and Why Was My Case Placed in SR?409

 Overview of the SR Process410

 Common SR Issues and Pitfalls412

 Managing Employer Expectations.....412

 Deadlines and Technical Issues.....413

 Recent Developments at BALCA.....413

 Conclusion414

 Appendix 1: Sample Notification of Supervised Recruitment.....415

 Appendix 2: Sample Recruitment Instructions421

 Appendix 3: Sample Recruitment Report Instructions427

TO FILE OR NOT TO FILE: STRATEGIES FOR CARRYING A PERM THROUGH THE FINAL ACT OF APPELLATE REVIEW431

 Assessing the Case.....432

 Requests for Reconsideration432

 Request for BALCA Review433

 Is a Request for Review the Best Option?434

 Preparing Your Request for Reconsideration to the CO or Request for BALCA Review.....434

 Regulatory Requirements.....434

 Strategic Considerations435

 Recommendations for Drafting the Request for Reconsideration or Review.....436

 Heading.....436

 Statement of the Case.....436

 Standard of Review.....437

 Jurisdiction.....437

 Argument437

 Conclusion438

 Closing Thoughts438

 Appendix 1: Sample Audit Notification.....439

 Appendix 2: Sample Response to Audit Notification442

 Appendix 3: Sample PERM Denial Notice447

 Appendix 4: Sample Request for Reconsideration.....449

WORST-CASE SCENARIOS: REVOCATION, INVALIDATION, DEBARMENT, SUSPENSION, APPEAL, AND THE PARAMOUNT IMPORTANCE OF DOCUMENT RETENTION..... 453

- Introduction..... 453
- Labor Certification Determination..... 453
- Supervised Recruitment..... 454
- Revocation of Approved Labor Certification..... 456
- Invalidation of Labor Certification 456
- Suspension and Debarment..... 456
- Appeal to the Board of Alien Labor Certification Appeals..... 457
- Document Retention 458
- Conclusion..... 459

ETHICS IN PERM: WHERE THE LINE IS AND HOW TO DRAW IT 461

- Drafting the Job Description 461
 - What Are the Job Description Parameters in a PERM Labor Certification? 462
 - Who Should Drive the Process of Confirming the Job Description and Requirements?..... 463
 - To What Extent May Preference Category Implications Impact the Identification of Job Requirements?..... 463
 - What Is an Attorney’s Role When an Employer’s Job Description Is Less Than Well Defined? .. 464
- Testing The Labor Market: What Is the Attorney’s Role in the Recruitment Process? 464
 - Recruitment Sources 464
 - Reviewing Applicants 465
 - Willing, Able, and Available 466
 - Diversion..... 467
 - Layoffs 467
- Document Retention: Where Does the Attorney’s Role End? 468
- Client Relations: What to Do When You Have an Uncooperative Client..... 470
- “Help, I’m Over My Head!”: When to Call a Mentor 471

APPENDIX OF SAMPLE LETTERS, CHECKLISTS, MEMOS, CHARTS, AND OTHER PRACTICE AIDS..... 473

- Template 1: PERM Labor Certification Checklist..... 477
- Template 2: Memorandum Regarding Labor Certification..... 479
- Template 3: Form of Engagement Letter Content 483
- Template 4: Form of Dual Representation Letter 485
- Template 5: Employer Intake (All Employers)..... 487
- Template 6: Job Description/Minimum Requirements Document 489
- Template 7: Employer Intake (Small Employers)..... 493
- Template 8: Set Up An Account on DOL’s FLAG System..... 495
- Template 9: Employee Intake 497
- Template 10: Employee Qualification Checklist 503
- Template 11: Form of Correspondence Relaying Skill/Experience/Etc. Statements..... 505
- Template 12: Sample Business Necessity Questions for Employer 509
- Template 13: Form of Business Necessity Memorandum 511
- Template 14: Notice of Filing..... 515
- Template 15: PERM Advertising Efforts Chart..... 517
- Template 16: Recruitment Calculation Timeline 519
- Template 17: Recruitment Instruction Memorandum..... 521
- Template 18: Form of Audit File Cover Sheet and Index 529
- Template 19: Form of Recruitment Report..... 531

Template 20: Prefiling Review Request Correspondence.....533
Template 21: Postfiling Memorandum to File535
Template 22: PERM Document Retention Checklist537
Template 23: Form of Employer Filing Confirmation Correspondence to Employer539
Template 24: Postfiling Correspondence Regarding Status of Case and Processing Time541
Template 25: Form of Audit Response Letter.....543
SUBJECT-MATTER INDEX.....547